

POLICY EVALUATION OF THE DISTRIBUTION OF BOARDING SCHOOLS IN BANTEN PROVINCE IN 2020

UJANG GIRI¹, RAHMAN MULYAWAN², BUDIMAN RUSLI³ and ASEP SUMARYANA⁴

^{1,2,3,4} Public Administration, Faculty of Social Science and Political Science, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia. ¹ Email: ujang20001@mail.unpad.ac.id

Abstract

This study examines the Evaluation of Policy on the Distribution of Grants for Islamic Boarding Schools in Banten Province in 2020. The problems in this research are the distribution of grant funds for Islamic boarding schools is hampered, administrative problems in granting grants, do not have a special team that monitors the distribution of grant funds, and problems resulting from grants. Corruption cases committed by government officials. The theory used in this research is the Policy Evaluation theory from William N. Dunn (2018) in which there are six dimensions, namely: Effectiveness; Efficiency; Adequacy; Alignment; Responsiveness; and Accuracy. The research method uses qualitative research methods. Qualitative approach research is carried out based on the problems studied with the aim of exploring or building a proposition or explaining the meaning behind reality. Therefore, a qualitative research method was chosen to find out the information and findings on the policy of granting Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province. The results of the study show that: (1) The Banten Provincial Government does not yet have good governance in managing grant funds for Islamic boarding schools. (2) The Covid-19 pandemic does not have a significant impact on the grant fund management process. (3) There are many individuals who hinder the process of granting grants to pesantren. The conclusion of this study is that the policy of granting Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province has various obstacles and obstacles, one of the biggest obstacles arising from the budgeting process so that it raises other problems. The new finding in this research is the existence of a budgeting concept in the policy evaluation dimension from William N. Dunn. Budgeting in policy evaluation is the process of discovering the shortcomings or advantages of the budget making process in the past in order to find an appropriate budget formulation in the future.

Keywords: Evaluation; Policy; Grant Fund; Boarding school

I. INTRODUCTION

Banten Province is one of the provinces in Indonesia that distributes grants to Islamic boarding schools with Banten Governor Regulation Number 10 of 2019 concerning Guidelines for Providing Grants and Social Assistance Sourced from the Regional Income and Expenditure Budget of Banten Province. Distribution of grant funds is channeled to several Islamic boarding schools spread across 8 (eight) districts/cities in Banten Province.

Grants are one aspect of public administration that aims to support the administration of government affairs. Grants are then given by the government to institutions that are deemed in need in order to make these institutions more developed and developing. Grants are a very important aspect in the administration of government affairs, especially in the regions. Because it is very important in supporting the implementation of regional affairs, it is necessary to evaluate policies related to grants issued by regional governments so that the implementation and processes of public administration can run well.

This policy regarding grants for Islamic boarding schools began on April 17 2018, at that time the Banten Islamic Boarding School Gathering Forum (FSPP) submitted a grant application for 2018 in the amount of IDR 27,766,000,000 (twenty seven billion seven hundred and seventy seven million rupiah).

Then the grant application evaluation team for the Public Welfare Bureau of the Regional Secretariat of Banten Province recommended to the Banten Province Regional Government Budget Team (TAPD) to allocate a grant for the Islamic Boarding School Gathering Forum (FSPP) in the amount of Rp. 6,608,000,000 (six billion six hundred and eight million rupiah) allocated for organizational continuity in the Banten Islamic Boarding School Gathering Forum (FSPP).

Then in September 2018 the Banten Province Islamic Boarding School Gathering Forum (FSPP) again submitted a grant proposal worth Rp. 71.74 billion for the Islamic boarding school empowerment program and operations and other activities, after having an audience with the Governor of Banten, then November 2018 the People's Welfare Bureau evaluated and sent a recommendation to the Regional Government Budget Team (TAPD) so that the Islamic Boarding School Gathering Forum (FSPP) was recorded as a recipient a grant of Rp. 68,016,000,000, - (sixty eight billion sixteen million rupiah).

The recommendation was given at the direction of the Governor of Banten. In 2018 the Regional Secretary of Banten Province as Chair of the Regional Government Budget Team (TAPD) issued an official note on the list of potential grant recipients as well as a governor's decision stipulating the Banten Province Islamic Boarding School Gathering Forum (FSPP) as a recipient of Rp. 68,016,000,000,- (sixty eight billion sixteen million rupiah). Since then this policy has been implemented (Trianita & Iqbal, 2021).

The realization of the Banten Province Islamic Boarding School grant assistance program for the 2020 budget year is Rp. 111,090,000,000. - (One hundred and eleven billion and ninety million rupiah), this amount is disbursed with a nominal value for each boarding school of Rp. 30,000,000,- (thirty million rupiah) spread across 8 urban districts with a total of 3,703 Islamic Boarding Schools with the following details:

NO	REGION	TOTAL	
		ISLAMIC BOARDING SCHOOL	PAGU
1	Serang City	181	5,430,000,000
2	cilegon city	35	1,050,000,000
3	Tangerang City	69	2,070,000,000
4	South Tangerang City	46	1,380,000,000
5	Serang District	841	25,230,000,000
6	Pandeglang regency	819	24,570,000,000
7	Lebanese Regency	1087	32,610,000,000
8	Tangerang Regency	625	18,750,000,000
TOTAL		3,703	111,090,000,000

Data source: Banten Province People's Welfare Bureau, 2021

According to the data, Lebak Regency has a total of 1,087 Islamic boarding schools and is the largest compared to the total Islamic boarding schools in other districts. Based on these data, Lebak Regency is also the highest grant recipient compared to other districts.

This research examines various deficiencies and factors that become problems in the policy of grants for Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province. Furthermore, researchers consider that evaluation is very important for grant distribution programs and social assistance. This is because the policies that have been running for a period of 3 years are still experiencing the same problems, this reinforces the poor evaluation stage of this policy.

Therefore it is necessary to evaluate this policy. Policy evaluation is an activity involving the estimation or assessment of policies that include substance, implementation and impact (Anderson, 2003). Policy evaluation is seen as a functional activity, meaning that policy evaluation is not only carried out at the final stage but for the entire policy process.

According to W. Dunn, the term evaluation has a related meaning, each of which refers to the application of several value scales to the results of policies and programs (Dunn, 2008). Evaluation has a scope, namely: conclusions, clarification, criticism, adjustments and reformulation of the problem. Policy evaluation according to (Dunn, 2013) has six variables, namely: Effectiveness; Efficiency; Adequacy; alignment; Responsiveness; and Accuracy.

In addition, the problems that arise in this policy do not only focus on distribution, but are comprehensive in all existing policy processes from planning to evaluation itself. Thus, the author is interested in researching "Policy Evaluation of the Distribution of Grants for Islamic Boarding Schools in Banten Province in 2020"

II. METHOD

This study uses qualitative research methods with the aim of describing and analyzing the policy evaluation of the distribution of Islamic boarding school grants in Banten Province in 2020, so that an understanding is obtained and the factors that play a role in it are analyzed. Qualitative research also emphasizes the process aspect of research results which reveal the problem as it is in accordance with the reality in the research field through written or spoken words from people and observed behavior. Thus, this research method was selected and considered relevant for collecting data according to needs with research problems through the interpretation of the process and meaning for the formulation of a model in evaluating the policy of distributing Islamic boarding school grants in Banten Province in 2020.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Effectiveness

Effectiveness is always related to the relationship between the expected results and the actual results achieved. Effectiveness according to Sedarmayanti (2009:59) is a measure that provides an overview of the extent to which targets can be achieved. In general, effectiveness shows the extent to which the goals set have been achieved. Objectives are very important in measuring

the effectiveness of a program. The difficulty in implementing this policy is technically quite difficult because there is no integrated system yet for data collection on the distribution of grants to Islamic boarding schools. The data still has to be processed manually by the executor (Tempo, 2021).

The amount of grants disbursed was only 30,000,000 and could not provide significant benefits, with this value considered too small to build and develop education at the Islamic boarding school level. And it is not effective against the goals to be achieved. Apart from the nominal amount being too small, what makes this policy ineffective is the weak oversight of the verification team which is one of the reasons for the ineffectiveness of this policy. Oversight that is not carried out in the light of various reasons, one of which is the reason for the budget, causes low control of prospective grant recipients, so that many elements are used to take advantage of this grant funding.

Efficiency

Efficiency refers to the amount of effort required to produce a certain level of effectiveness. Efficiency, which is a synonym for economic rationality, is the relationship between effectiveness and effort, the latter generally being measured in monetary costs. Efficiency is usually determined by calculating the unit cost of a product or service. Policies that achieve the highest effectiveness at the lowest cost are called efficient” (Dunn, 2013: 430). The amount given in the amount of 30,000,000 does not meet the standards and needs of Islamic boarding schools, if distributed to Islamic boarding schools it will not have a significant impact on the welfare of Islamic boarding schools.

The grant policy has explicitly and in detail regulated the grant mechanism, where the purpose of grants to Islamic boarding schools is to realize the vision of the Governor and Deputy Governor of Banten for 2017-2022. Where one of his visions is to create a Banten society that has good morals. Grant assistance to Islamic boarding schools in 2018 was based on Banten Governor Regulation Number 10 of 2019 concerning Guidelines for Granting Grants and Social Assistance Sourced from the Banten Provincial Revenue and Expenditure Budget. Apart from that, it is also based on the vision and mission of the Governor and Deputy Governor of Banten Province 2017-2022. One of its visions is "Banten that is Forward, Independent, Competitive, Prosperous and Has Good Morals". The clarity of this policy was conveyed by the Head of the Social and Religious Section of the Public Welfare Bureau of the Banten Provincial Government who is also the Verification Team for Grant Assistance to Islamic Boarding Schools.

The policy consistency indicator is that the implementation of grant aid policies for Islamic boarding schools is always changing. This is due to adjusting to the regulations above, namely adjusting to the regulations of the Permendagri. Based on data from the Banten Province Regional Development Administration Bureau, since the grant program was rolled out in Banten Province from 2002 to 2019, grant regulations have always changed, at least 10 changes have been made. The change is not in substance but only in an administrative manner. Even so, the title of the regulation is united with social assistance, so it's not just a separate grant.

One of the problems with this policy is that the amount of the budget spent has not been able to help Islamic boarding schools run operations and improve the quality of education at Islamic boarding schools. So when referring to the concept of efficiency according to Dunn, which explains that efficiency is the achievement of effectiveness with the minimum cost, it is not fully in accordance with this policy. Because with a budget of 30 million per Islamic boarding school, it has not been able to cover all the needs needed for the development of Islamic boarding schools, especially in terms of building infrastructure.

Adequacy

Justice in public policy according to Dunn (2013: 434) is that justice is closely related to legal and social rationality and refers to the distribution of consequences and efforts between different groups in society. All Islamic boarding schools receive Rp. 30,000,000, but in this case the principle of distribution is not correct because it is not seen from other aspects, including the number of students, building area and level of need for Islamic boarding schools. This must be considered so that there is an even distribution of grant funds.

The results of the study prove that the budget is still insufficient to meet the needs and development of Islamic boarding schools. Another thing that is a problem is the amount of money given by this government grant is evenly distributed to all Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province. The informants felt that this was unfair because the number of students from each pesantren was different, and the needs that were being carried out were also different.

With the lack of budget given to these Islamic boarding schools, they have not been able to meet the needs of each Islamic boarding school. So this makes the policy unable to realize the desired positive outcomes to make the people of Banten, especially Islamic boarding schools, become independent, prosperous, and have good morals.

Equity

Dunn states that the criterion of equity is closely related to legal and social rationality and refers to the distribution of effects and effort between different groups in society. Dunn said that policies that are oriented towards equity are policies whose efforts are distributed fairly. A certain program may be effective and sufficient if the costs and benefits are evenly distributed.

The target group of this policy, namely Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province, is a homogeneous group so that it facilitates the process of implementing the policy. The target group is also specific to one particular religion, in this case, the Islamic religion. So that the target group has a voice and a unified mind in implementing this policy.

The following is the number of students and the population in 2020 in Banten Province:

No	Regency	Boarding school	boarding school type		Number of students		Number of Population in 2020
			Education units	Organizer education units	Mukim	Not living	
1	Pandeglang	1168	5	1163	25,168	35,841	1.272.687
2	Lebak	1593	1505	88	13,297	37,218	1386793
3	Tangerang	439	371	68	22,746	6,844	3245619
4	Serang	1023	847	176	15,115	5,080	1622630
5	Tangerang City	114	38	76	11,591	4,523	1895486
6	Cilegon City	45	20	25	3,732	1,122	434896
7	Serang city	121	91	30	9,834	1,556	692101
8	South Tangerang City	76	7	69	10,512	3,858	1354350
						TOTAL	11904562

The realization of the Banten Province Islamic Boarding School grant assistance program for the 2020 budget year is Rp. 111.090.000.000,- (One hundred and eleven billion and ninety million rupiah), with details as follows:

No	Region	Total	
		Islamic Boarding School	Pagu
1	Serang City	181	5,430,000,000
2	Cilegon City	35	1,050,000,000
3	Tangerang City	69	2,070,000,000
4	South Tangerang City	46	1,380,000,000
5	Serang District	841	25,230,000,000
6	Pandeglang regency	819	24,570,000,000
7	Lebak Regency	1087	32,610,000,000
8	Tangerang Regency	625	18,750,000,000
TOTAL		3,703	111,090,000,000

The data above shows that the results of the recapitulation of recipients of Islamic boarding school assistance for the 2020 fiscal year are based on Banten Governor Regulation Number 10 of 2019 concerning guidelines for providing grants and social assistance sourced from the regional revenue and expenditure budget of Banten province. The total number of Islamic boarding schools is 3,703 with a budget ceiling of Rp. 111,090,000,000,- (one hundred and eleven billion ninety million rupiah), with each Islamic boarding school receiving a grant of 30 million.

Referring to the explanation (Dunn, 2013), the distribution of these grants does have the same nominal values for all Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province. However, in not being able to achieve the desired justice, because Islamic boarding schools located in the province of Banten have their own characteristics. With all the nominal values being the same, of course it

is not enough for Islamic boarding schools with characteristics that are still left behind both in terms of human resources and in terms of building infrastructure.

Responsiveness

Responsiveness relates to how far a policy can satisfy the needs, preferences, or values of certain groups of people (Dunn, 2013: 437). The responsiveness criterion is important because an analysis that can meet all other criteria (effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity) will still fail if it does not answer the actual needs of the groups that should benefit from a policy.

Regarding the responsiveness of this policy, the implementer cannot maximally implement the policy. This is related to the lack of human resources managing pesantren grant funds. The results of the study explained that in the Regencies/Cities in Banten Province, where there were 400 Islamic boarding schools, only a few people verified them.

Barriers to communication between local government leaders, in this case the Governor of Banten, who communicated a lot informally with kiyai or Islamic boarding school administrators, was not able to be translated administratively by the Welfare Bureau as the implementing OPD in religious development. This condition causes difficulties in realizing the governor's policies which are verbally conveyed to kiyai, and this is not as easy as adjusting to the bureaucratic flow that must be taken by the Bureau of People's Welfare in serving grants to Islamic boarding schools.

Accuracy

Accuracy according to (Dunn, 2013) is a criterion of accuracy closely related to rationality, substantive, because the question of policy accuracy is not related to individual criteria but two or more criteria together. Accuracy refers to the value or price of program objectives and to the strength of the assumptions that underlie these objectives.

There were several findings in the field, namely irregularities in the distribution of grant funds which resulted in state losses and legal findings. This shows that the distribution of Islamic boarding school grants was not distributed in its entirety without field verification and supervision from the Banten Province Transportation Service.

The FSPP was directed by the People's Welfare Bureau to use operational funds to create an Islamic boarding school information system. If built, this system can tidy up the data of the pesantren that receive assistance. Then as a follow-up the social welfare bureau has held a number of trainings for 171 SIPP fillers.

The Islamic Boarding School Gathering Forum (FSPP) is the main originator of this grant assistance. FSPP submitted a proposal for a pesantren grant fund to the governor of Banten province in the amount of 27.766 billion on April 17 2017. The process continued until it finally began to be implemented in 2018. With this it can be seen that the electorate supports this policy. It can also be seen from the enthusiasm of the pesantren to register for the grant program.

Voter groups can intervene in decisions made by implementing agencies through various comments with the intention of changing decisions. In this case, this policy will not be continued specifically for 2021 because it is currently under evaluation, at the request of various parties. Due to problems in the implementation process, this policy was finally suspended.

Lack of planning and community participation and the frequency of repeating messages is not effective due to lack of socialization (Aas. 2021). Only one percent of the total funds are deployed here. Where there are Islamic boarding schools that do not meet the requirements to be beneficiaries. In addition, there were Islamic boarding schools that refused to provide financial aid so that the financial assistance was returned to the regional treasury by the Banten Province FSPP.

IV. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the research and the description of the analysis that the researchers have included in the discussion of the research, what can be drawn as a conclusion in this study is that the results of the research show that the Policy Evaluation on Distribution of Grants for Islamic Boarding Schools in Banten Province in 2020 refers to the concept of policy evaluation according to Willian N. Dunn (2018) where the success of a policy must be seen from six dimensions, namely: Effectiveness; Efficiency; Adequacy; Even distribution; Responsiveness; and Accuracy has various constraints and obstacles in some of these dimensions.

The problem regarding the lack of optimal monitoring and supervision that was carried out became a problem that arose in the process of managing and distributing grant funds for Islamic boarding schools in the Banten Province area. The absence of a special team to oversee this policy has also been one of the causes of problems in the process of distributing grant budgets to Islamic boarding schools, ranging from inaccuracies in targeting, injustice in the provision of grant funds, to extortion committed by several regional officials.

Of the various problems that arose during the process of implementing the grant funding policy for Islamic boarding schools, a new finding was found in the field that there was no budgeting process to create a special team or monitoring process for this program which was the main source of problems that caused other problems to arise. The absence of a special team to oversee this program has resulted in problems such as extortion committed by unscrupulous regional officials.

Therefore, it can be explained that the policy evaluation on the granting of grants at Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province has not been implemented due to the absence of a budgeting process which has given rise to various other problems, besides that the delay in response from the government is also one of the reasons why this policy evaluation has not gone well. Good.

References

- ❖ Anderson, J. . . (2003). *Public Policy Making: An Introduction*. Houghton Mifflin Company.
- ❖ Asshiddiqie, J. (2006). *Konstitusi & Konstitusionalisme Indonesia*. Sekretariat Jenderal dan Kepaniteraan Mahkamah Konstitusi RI.
- ❖ Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitatives and Mix Method Approaches*. In SAGE Publications (4th ed). Sage Publications. <https://doi.org/10.2307/328794>
- ❖ Dunn, W. N. (2008). *Public Policy Analysis: An Introduction*. In Pearson. Prentice Hill.
- ❖ Dye, T. R. (2017). *Understanding Public Policy*. In *Understanding Public Policy*.
- ❖ Edward III, G. C. (1980). *Implementing Public Policy*. Congressional Quarterly Press.
- ❖ Finsterbusch, K., & Motz, A. (1980). *Social Research for Policy Decisions*. Wadsworth Publishing Company.
- ❖ Lester, J. P., & Stewart, J. (2000). *Public policy : an evolutionary approach*. Wadsworth Thomson Learning.
- ❖ Maslan, M. R., Rasdianto, F. Y., & Rifai, B. (2021). *Menelusuri Ponpes Penerima Dana Hibah Banten*. DetikX. <https://news.detik.com/x/detail/investigasi/20210608/Ponpes-Hantu-Penerima-Duit-Hibah/>
- ❖ Maxwell, J. . (1996). *Qualitative Research Design: An Interactive Approach*. Sage Publications.
- ❖ Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis : an expanded sourcebook (6th ed.)*. Sage Publications.