

EVALUATION OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION PRACTICES AT A SELECTED COMPANY IN WESTVILLE DURBAN SOUTH AFRICA

BANGURA, S.

D.Phil. Management Science Specialising in Human Resource Management Candidate, Durban University of Technology, Republic of South Africa. Email: fannysisi39@gmail.com

Dr. LOURENS, M.E.

Deputy Dean, Faculty of Management Science, Durban University of Technology, Republic of South Africa. Email: melaniel@dut.ac.za

Abstract

In today's business environment, companies must plan and implement recruitment and selection, especially for candidates who are good for the job because this is a good recruitment and selection point for the company. However, poor recruitment and selection processes can affect the quality of employees and their jobs in the organization. This study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of recruitment and selection at a selected company in Westville Durban. The importance of attracting recruiting and selecting talented employees in a competitive business environment makes it important for organizations to adopt best practices in recruitment and selection in organization. First, the study shows various aspects of recruitment and selection in organizations. Second, recruitment and selection are all defined. Finally, strategies are proposed to reduce the difficulties encountered in the recruitment and selection process. The study utilized a qualitative research method and employed purposive sampling. Thematic analysis was conducted to analyze the data. The results indicate that recruitment and selection are significant factors for both employees and organizations. Furthermore, it is imperative to note that a sound approach to recruitment and selection practices holds utmost significance and should serve as the fundamental basis for all employment planning and selection within an organization. The outcomes undeniably affirm the crucial role that recruitment and selection play in attaining organizational goals and objectives. Ongoing research consistently verifies that collaboration is pivotal for the triumph of any recruitment and selection process. The suggestions put forth explicitly recognize the necessity for thorough planning and meticulous execution of recruitment and selection endeavours. Additionally, human resource planning is duly acknowledged as crucial and encompasses the vital facets of recruitment and selection, as processes such as procuring a commendable occupation and adhering to recruitment and selection policies bear considerable importance.

Keywords: Recruitment and Selection, Human Resource Management Planning

INTRODUCTION

Effective recruitment and selection play a crucial role in attaining the most qualified candidates, reducing employee turnover, and enhancing employee performance, all of which are vital components of performance management. These aspects hold equal significance for both small businesses and large corporations. However, the approaches utilized differ, and there exist varying perspectives among human resource management researchers and experts regarding the most effective methods of recruitment and selection. Adu-Darkoh (2014) asserts that human resource management practices are interconnected with organizational effectiveness and contends that significant attention given by top management to these practices, particularly

recruitment and selection, will greatly enhance job performance. Achieving successful employee recruitment entails carefully considering the compatibility between the chosen candidate and the organization. To accomplish this, group selection questions and a comprehensive selection process provide a solid foundation for conducting interviews. Department managers can contribute to establishing a favorable relationship between the job and the candidate by selecting individuals suited for the role within the relevant department (Dowling and Zhu, 2015).

Conversely, inadequate recruitment and selection procedures can profoundly impact performance. Armstrong and Taylor (2016) propose that insufficient planning and utilization of recruitment and selection strategies result in employee turnover, wasted time, financial resources, and effort especially during periods of decreased activity. Moreover, haphazard implementation of recruitment and selection practices within an organization can yield high training costs and product loss, ultimately leading to the departure of top-performing employees.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The Concept of Recruitment and Selection

Conferring to Harrison and Kessel (2014), the recruitment and selection encompasses the series of activities undertaken by an organization in relation to recruiting and selecting employees and applicants. It is a common practice for all organizations to have employment and recruitment policies and procedures in place. In larger and multinational organizations, the responsibility for recruitment and selection often falls under the purview of the human resources department. Additionally, Mathis and Jackson (2018) provide further insight by defining recruitment as the process of attracting suitable candidates who possess the necessary skills, talents, and personal characteristics required to work for an organization. Furthermore, selection, as noted by Harrison and Kessel (2014), involves the identification of a pool of candidates during the recruitment process, followed by a thorough selection process that includes interviews, background checks, and assessments to determine the most qualified individual(s) for the position.

Recruitment and Selection Process in Organisations

Dessler (2014) suggest that four stages are applicable in a recruitment and selection process, these are namely defining requirements, planning campaigns, attracting candidates, and selection.

Defining Requirements

This stage includes determining the content and conditions of the job, as well as laying the foundation for the meaning of the role, often referred to as the job description and specific tasks, which refer to the knowledge, skills, and behaviours required to perform the job at a good level (DeCenzo & Robbins, 2017).

Planning Recruitment Campaigns

Noe, Hollenbeck, Gerhart, and Wright (2014) state that recruitment requires planning, design and coordination, and efforts to develop student skills. Voluntary contribution to a good and profitable business. Therefore, the recruitment plan includes the number and type of employees needed to fill or expand a shortage or deficiency in the organisation.

Attracting Candidates

Mullins (2011) agrees that when the company creates talent, the next step in recruitment and selection is to recruit candidates by scanning and reviewing other internal and external reference sources (advertising, e-recruitment, agencies and consultants) to support the desired job. Attracting candidates is about identifying, measuring and using the most appropriate resources.

Selecting Candidates

Mathis and Jackson (2018) argue that candidate selection aims to find candidates with qualifications who can complete the tasks assigned to them. For this reason, it is the matching of talent, experience, skill and education with the requirements of the job and making the right choice among the candidates.

Sources of Recruitment and Selection

Finding the right candidates and informing them about open positions in the industry is the most important aspect of recruitment and selection. Candidates can be internal or external to the institution. Mullins (2011) pointed out that there are two sources of recruitment, internal and external.

Internal Sources

In terms of human resource management, internal recruitment refers to the recruitment of people by the organisation. For this reason, Mello (2014) stated that employees can be found in the organisation. Thus, when the organisation is deficient, it can be given to already paid employees. A qualified employee taking a higher position motivates all employees in the organisation to work harder. Employees will be informed about these activities through internal notices. Some examples of internal recruiting sources includes but are not limited to, promotion and transfer.

Promotions

Harrison and Kessel (2014) state that promotion is a process that enables people to move to more prestigious, responsible and higher-paying positions. Non-professional jobs can be filled from within the organisation. Advertising does not increase the number of people in an organisation. The person seeking a higher position leaves their current job. Promotion motivates employees to improve performance, so they get support when needed.

Transfer

Booth and Hamer (2010) suggest that leaving a job involves people moving from their current job to another similar job. These do not reflect changes in rank, role or prestige. The number of people will not increase with the transfer.

External Sources

External recruiting is a process that entails the recruitment and selection of individuals from external sources, who are not currently associated with the organization. Essentially, this approach involves seeking applicants from beyond the organizational boundaries (Elbert Hatfield Warnich & Carrell, 2014). Outsourcing, frequently employed in areas such as advertising and employee exchange, represents one of the predominant practices within external recruitment strategies.

Advertising

Bestowing to Van Niekerk, Steyn, Cascio, and Aguinis (2018), the predominant method utilized by skilled workers, managers, and senior employees for recruitment is advertising. Various platforms, such as newspapers and magazines, are employed to publish announcements that garner the attention of numerous potential candidates. Nevertheless, Hamermesh (2015) cautions that devising an effective job posting entails confidentiality and, should the company wish to remain undisclosed, it may opt to request prospective applicants to submit applications via mail or through designated advertising agencies.

Employment Exchanges

Employment Exchanges typically serve as platforms for the recruitment of unskilled and semi-skilled labor, often functioning as recruitment agencies. It has been advised by Mathis and Jackson (2018) that, on certain occasions, it may be beneficial to inform companies about job changes within the workplace. Traditionally, these organizations were predominantly sought after by business owners as a final recourse. Job seekers and employers are connected through the utilization of job clearinghouses (Page, 2010).

Theoretical Framework

The study in question utilizes the theoretical framework of Contingency theory. Extensive empirical evidence has consistently supported the theoretical linkage between content variables and the partitioning method (Adu-Darkoh, 2014), with its explanatory power being well-documented. This theory is widely employed in the field of human resources to enhance comprehension of various issues, particularly those pertaining to recruitment and selection processes. In the realm of recruitment, numerous correlations have been identified between the content of the position and discrepancies across research topics. The impact of recruitment and selection practices on organizational efficacy has recently garnered significant attention. Factors such as firm knowledge, firm reputation, firm behaviors (Mello, 2014), and mission/organization image (Steyn, Bezuidenhout, & Grobler, 2017) have been thoroughly analyzed, and their substantial influence on recruitment processes and outcomes has been established. Neo et al. (2015) employed contingency theory to examine the contingent nature

of recruitment and selection processes considering environmental variables. They identified two key factors affecting the success of recruitment and job selection performance: job complexity (and potential specialization) and information uncertainty.

Based on these factors, they were able to establish four recruitment models.

- Autocratic: when information is less and complex tasks are less. Organisations should aim to recruit local workers from the minority workforce.
- Bureaucratic: When information uncertainty is low, but operational complexity is high. Organisations should aim to hire specific employees.
- Commitment: When information uncertainty is high and business complexity is low. Recruitment with this model is geared towards attracting cultural workers.
- Professional: When information uncertainty is high and business complexity is high. It is required that a recruiting strategy focuses on employees with skills that enable them to deal with the confusion created by uncertain information.

METHODOLOGY

This study is grounded in qualitative research methodology. The sample size for this study comprised of 10 individuals who were selected from the employees' relatives. The participants were chosen using the purposive sampling method. The selected sample consisted of South African men and women from all racial backgrounds, between the ages of 32 and 45, who possessed more than 5 years of experience in the field of human resources. Our research involved conducting interviews with recruiters and job planners in order to gain insights into the recruitment and selection process. This investigation confirms that recruitment and selection interviews hold significance not only within the scope of human resource management practices but also in various other human resource activities, ranging from human resource management planning to the recruitment and selection phase, as well as in the establishment of recruitment and selection policies.

For data collection purposes, this study adopted an in-depth interview approach, employing an interview schedule comprising of nine questions. This method allowed participants the freedom to articulate and interpret their responses without undue restrictions.

Human resource management professionals were gaged regarding their comprehension of recruitment and selection processes, as well as the internal or external nature of their own recruitment and selection practices. Additionally, the significance of one-on-one interviews and psychological testing as crucial methods was explored among respondents. Furthermore, the discussion encompassed the potential ramifications of insufficient information on recruitment and selection outcomes. Participants gained insights into the correlation between inadequate management and ineffectiveness in recruitment and selection procedures, highlighting the necessity for proper job analysis.

Furthermore, it is essential to have formal policies in place regarding recruitment and selection processes to guarantee transparency and accountability. These policies should also ensure that employees are adequately informed through various channels such as office communications, intranets, and newsletters in the workplace. In this study, the collected data was analyzed using the thematic analysis approach as described by Braun and Clarke (2006) and cited by Mthembu (2018). Thematic analysis aims to uncover meaningful patterns in the data that can address research questions. The analysis involved a thorough process of data recognition, coding, and theme development. The identified themes were then evaluated to determine the research findings that aligned with the research objectives. Subsequently, the data was carefully analyzed and interpreted to draw conclusions and identify significant patterns and relationships. To ensure the trustworthiness and rigor of the study, the researcher adopted Guba's (1981) four measures, as emphasized by Mthembu (2018), including truth value, applicability, consistency, and neutrality. These measures were employed to uphold credibility, reliability, applicability, and objectivity in the findings presented, while also preventing any potential researcher bias.

Findings

The opinion of the respondents is that "both internal recruitment and external recruitment are preferred and important". In their words, there was a consensus with most of the respondents. Hence one respondent agreed that "*internal recruitment and selection is cost-effective and faster, thereby giving insider reason,*" while another respondent affirmed that "*external recruiting is important and relevant because it can add to the top or best pool of candidates for employees.*" More importantly, it has been noted that in many cases human resource managers spend time checking resumes and interviewing unsuitable candidates. Thus, it is important for organisational human resource management departments to handle their recruitment and selection process well so that such an undesirable situation will be avoided.

Mathis and Jackson (2018), in recognising the important role of recruitment and selection consultants in recruitment and selection, pointed out that they use a variety of tests such as intelligence, character, aptitude, integrity, and motivation to support recruitment and selection in identifying suitable candidates. Another participant thinks that the use and importance of recruitment and selection consultants can increase the effectiveness of recruitment and selection because "*they often use applicants tracking system to screen candidates during the recruitment and selection process, thereby ensuring that qualified employees are found.*" Interviews and psychometric tests are also considered important aspects of recruitment and selection. Most respondents recognised the importance of interviews and psychometric tests, as they provide a thorough understanding of the candidate's abilities and personality, as well as the information needed to improve performance in the organisation. One respondent claimed that psychological testing created "*an opportunity to compare results and compare them with other candidates who had applied before.*"

Zhu and Dowling (2015) confirmed that psychological tests are useful in investigating the personality and abilities of prospective job applicants and the concept of insufficient knowledge about employment in recruitment and selection was considered as affecting the

recruitment and selection process. Most respondents agreed that insufficient information on workforce shortages can also affect recruitment and selection exercises in organizations. Therefore, one respondent declared that *"Job postings that contain appropriate information about the job vacancy are important because information about qualifications and advice on requests can improve the organization's recruitment and selection process."*

Elbert et al. (2018) stated that it is important to provide all employees with sufficient information about the job posting that allows them to understand the job posting clearly. In addition, Armstrong and Taylor (2016) argue that the lack of information disclosed in the recruitment and selection process does not provide equality in organisations, therefore, the need for appropriate information in job advertisements is very important. Most respondents agreed that poor work and election practices could result in the wrong person being hired for the job, often resulting in having to redo the entire new employment process.

Mathis and Jackson (2018) argue that bad choices can lead to poor hiring and decision-making. Poor human resource planning is identified in the study as a limiting factor in the effectiveness of recruitment and selection. One respondent agreed that *"Poor human resource planning can have a significant impact on the organisation's business and adversely affect the organisation's recruitment and selection process."* Adu-Darkoh (2014) pointed out that poor human resource planning can lead to poor employee performance and poor organisational performance. One participant agreed that poor human resource planning can affect *"work and employee productivity."*

Mello (2014) recognises that appropriate human resource management planning can complement the job analysis/definition with the vision of the organisation, thereby making job research knowledge important to employees. Respondents' understanding of whether there is a statutory recruitment policy and selection policy to ensure transparency and accountability in recruitment and selection. One respondent agreed with the importance of a legitimate recruitment and selection policy, with the view that *"current recruitment and selection policy can improve the process as it provides a way to meet the needs of the business."* Booth and Hamer (2010) argue that hiring and selection rules make the process more reliable and promote diversity and gender equality in the workplace.

DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

The results of this study have indicated that internal and external recruitment sources are important in the recruitment and selection process. Most respondents acknowledge that recruitment and selection agencies and recruitment and selection consultants are critical alternatives to in-house recruitment and selection practitioners who because of workload may be engaged and will find it difficult to effectively plan and implement a successful recruitment and selection programming. Interview and psychometric testing and the provision of adequate information were considered significant. Issues such as constructive human resource planning were projected to be important in the recruitment and selection process. Some human resource practitioners assert that an effective existing recruitment and selection policy ensures that the overall recruitment and selection process is being conducted fairly and legitimately and a fair

and authentic policy allows a candidate to take legal action if they feel they are being discriminated against any factor.

Limitations of the Study and Directions for Future Research

The study was restricted to a selected company in Westville Durban. Ideally, owing to the changing nature of business operations there is a need for studying the effectiveness of recruitment and selection practices in a broader segment. However, because of various constraints, this was not practicable for the researcher. Therefore, the findings of this study cannot be generalised to all sectors; generalization should be done with caution and with due consideration of a broad spectrum of factors that are unique to each sector.

Future studies could also examine recruitment and selection on broader segments in all sectors in South Africa, to undertake a comparative analysis among sectors, at provincial levels and even among other African countries.

RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

This investigation has focused on evaluating the effectiveness of recruitment and selection practices in organizations. The human resource division is still lagging in the idea of revisiting or evaluating the effectiveness of its recruitment and selection practices in efficiently contributing to the achievement of organisational objectives. To achieve this emphasis must be placed on the appropriateness of sources such as internal and external recruitment sources to source core competence in terms of job requirements. The role of recruitment and selection agencies and recruitment consultants must be recognized especially in processing and filtering application through tracking systems. Interviews and psychometric testing were considered important in the process of recruitment and selection as insight and a general idea of the candidate's abilities and personality.

Adequate information and well-organised human resource planning are affirmed to be leveraged in the effective execution of any recruitment and selection program. Having in place a well-documented recruitment and selection policy leverages diversity and equality, especially in terms of gender.

Acknowledgements

The authors declare that there are no financial or personal relationships that may have inappropriately influenced the writing of this article.

Reference

1. Adu-Darkoh, M. (2014) Employee Recruitment and Selection Practices in the Construction Industry in Ashanti Region MBA (HRM OPTION) Dissertation Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology Kumasi Ghana
2. Armstrong, M. and Taylor, S (2016). A Handbook of Human Resource Management Practice. (8th Ed.). London, UK: Kogan Page.
3. Booth, S. and Hamer, K. (2010). Labour Turnover in the Retail Industry: Predicting the Role of Individual, organisational and environmental factors. International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management.

Vol 35 No (4), pp:289–307.

4. Decenzo, D.A. and Robbins S. P. (2017). *Human Resource Management*. New York, Wiley.
5. Dessler, G. (2014) *Fundamentals of Human Resource Management*. 4th Edition, Global Edition, Pearson International.
6. Dowling, P & Zhu, C. (2015), 'Staffing Practices in Transition: some empirical evidence from China', *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, Vol. 13, No. 4, pp:569-597.
7. Elbert, N. Hatfield, R. Warnich, S., and Carrell, M. Hatfield, R. (2018) *Human Resource Management in South Africa*. Thomson, Pat Bond, London.
8. Hamermesh, D. (2015). *The Changing Distribution of Job Satisfaction*. *Journal of Human Resources*, Vol 36 No (1), pp:140–151.
9. Harrison, R. and Kessels, J. (2014). *Human Resource Development in a Knowledge Economy: An Organisational View*. New York: MacMillan.
10. Mathis, R.B. and Jackson, J.H. (2018). *Human Resource Management*. 10th Edition. Singapore: Thomson Asia Pty Ltd.
11. Mello, J. (2015). *Strategic Human Resource Management*. 4th ed. New York Cengage.
12. Mtembu, V.N. (2018) *Greening is not a Priority for Human Resource Management: insight from human resource practitioners*, *Acta Commercii* 18 (1) a575.doi.org/10.462as.v18:577.
13. Mullins, J.L. (2011). *Management and Organisational Behaviour*. 8th Edition. London: Pitman Publishing.
14. Noe, R., Hollenbeck, J., Gerhart, B. and Wright, P. (2014). *Fundamentals of human resource management*. New York, N.Y.: McGraw-Hill Education.
15. Page, N. (2010). *Costs of Staff Turnover*. Online. Available at: http://www.bestbooks.biz/html/employee_involvement.htm Date accessed: 19 July 2023
16. Steyn, R. Bezuidenhout, M. L. and Grobler, A. (2017) *Human Resource Practices and Affective Organisational Commitment: A sectoral comparative study*. *SA Journal of Human Resource Management*, [S.I.], v. 15, p. 9 pages, May 2017. ISSN 2071-078X. Available at: <https://sajhrm.co.za/index.php/sajhrm/article/view/841>. accessed: 25 June 2019. doi <https://doi.org/10.4102/sajhrm.v15i0.841>.
17. Van Niekerk, A. Steyn, L., Cascio, W. F. and Aguinis, H. (2018) *Applied Personnel Psychology*. Harlow, Essex: Pearson.